

# The Sedona Conference Cooperation Proclamation

*The Sedona Conference*



# The Sedona Conference Cooperation Proclamation

*Dialogue Designed to Move the Law  
Forward in a Reasoned and Just Way*



# The Sedona Conference Cooperation Proclamation

## Reprints

The Sedona Conference hereby expressly grants any interested party  
royalty-free reprint rights to this specific document.

---

**wgs**

Copyright 2008

The Sedona Conference

All Rights Reserved.

Visit [www.thesedonaconference.org](http://www.thesedonaconference.org)

---

# **The Sedona Conference Cooperation Proclamation**

*The Sedona Conference launches a coordinated effort to promote cooperation by all parties to the discovery process to achieve the goal of a “just, speedy, and inexpensive determination of every action.”*

The costs associated with adversarial conduct in pre-trial discovery have become a serious burden to the American judicial system. This burden rises significantly in discovery of electronically stored information (“ESI”). In addition to rising monetary costs, courts have seen escalating motion practice, overreaching, obstruction, and extensive, but unproductive discovery disputes – in some cases precluding adjudication on the merits altogether – when parties treat the discovery process in an adversarial manner. Neither law nor logic compels these outcomes.

With this Proclamation, The Sedona Conference launches a national drive to promote open and forthright information sharing, dialogue (internal and external), training, and the development of practical tools to facilitate cooperative, collaborative, transparent discovery. This Proclamation challenges the bar to achieve these goals and refocus litigation toward the substantive resolution of legal disputes.

## **Cooperation in Discovery is Consistent with Zealous Advocacy**

Lawyers have twin duties of loyalty: While they are retained to be zealous advocates for their clients, they bear a professional obligation to conduct discovery in a diligent and candid manner. Their combined duty is to strive in the best interests of their clients to achieve the best results at a reasonable cost, with integrity and candor as officers of the court. Cooperation does not conflict with the advancement of their clients’ interests - it enhances it. Only when lawyers confuse advocacy with adversarial conduct are these twin duties in conflict.

Lawyers preparing cases for trial need to focus on the full cost of their efforts – temporal, monetary, and human. Indeed, all stakeholders in the system – judges, lawyers, clients, and the general public – have an interest in establishing a culture of cooperation in the discovery process. Over-contentious discovery is a cost that has outstripped any advantage in the face of ESI and the data deluge. It is not in anyone’s interest to waste resources on unnecessary disputes, and the legal system is strained by “gamesmanship” or “hiding the ball,” to no practical effect.

Effort to change the culture of discovery from adversarial conduct to cooperation is not utopian.<sup>1</sup> It is, instead, an exercise in economy and logic. Establishing a culture of cooperation will channel valuable advocacy skills toward interpreting the facts and arguing the appropriate application of law.

---

<sup>1</sup> Gartner RAS Core Research Note G00148170, *Cost of eDiscovery Threatens to Skew Justice System*, 1D# G00148170, (April 20, 2007), at <http://www.h5technologies.com/pdf/gartner0607.pdf>. (While noting that “several . . . disagreed with the suggestion [to collaborate in the discovery process] . . . calling it ‘utopian’”, one of the “take-away’s” from the program identified in the Gartner Report was to “[s]trive for a collaborative environment when it comes to eDiscovery, seeking to cooperate with adversaries as effectively as possible to share the value and reduce costs.”).

# **The Sedona Conference Cooperation Proclamation**

## **Cooperative Discovery is Required by the Rules of Civil Procedure**

When the first uniform civil procedure rules allowing discovery were adopted in the late 1930s, “discovery” was understood as an essentially cooperative, rule-based, party-driven process, designed to exchange relevant information. The goal was to avoid gamesmanship and surprise at trial. Over time, discovery has evolved into a complicated, lengthy procedure requiring tremendous expenditures of client funds, along with legal and judicial resources. These costs often overshadow efforts to resolve the matter itself. The 2006 amendments to the Federal Rules specifically focused on discovery of “electronically stored information” and emphasized early communication and cooperation in an effort to streamline information exchange, and avoid costly unproductive disputes.

Discovery rules frequently compel parties to meet and confer regarding data preservation, form of production, and assertions of privilege. Beyond this, parties wishing to litigate discovery disputes must certify their efforts to resolve their difficulties in good faith.

Courts see these rules as a mandate for counsel to act cooperatively.<sup>2</sup> Methods to accomplish this cooperation may include:

1. Utilizing internal ESI discovery “point persons” to assist counsel in preparing requests and responses;
2. Exchanging information on relevant data sources, including those not being searched, or scheduling early disclosures on the topic of Electronically Stored Information;
3. Jointly developing automated search and retrieval methodologies to cull relevant information;
4. Promoting early identification of form or forms of production;
5. Developing case-long discovery budgets based on proportionality principles; and
6. Considering court-appointed experts, volunteer mediators, or formal ADR programs to resolve discovery disputes.

## **The Road to Cooperation**

It is unrealistic to expect a *sua sponte* outbreak of pre-trial discovery cooperation. Lawyers frequently treat discovery conferences as perfunctory obligations. They may fail to recognize or act on opportunities to make discovery easier, less costly, and more productive. New lawyers may not yet have developed cooperative advocacy skills, and senior lawyers may cling to a long-held “hide the ball” mentality. Lawyers who recognize the value of resources such as ADR and special masters may nevertheless overlook their application to discovery. And, there remain obstreperous counsel with no interest in cooperation, leaving even the best- intentioned to wonder if “playing fair” is worth it.

<sup>2</sup> See, e.g., *Board of Regents of University of Nebraska v BASF Corp.* No. 4:04-CV-3356, 2007 WL 3342423, at \*5 (D. Neb. Nov. 5, 2007) (“The overriding theme of recent amendments to the discovery rules has been open and forthright sharing of information by all parties to a case with the aim of expediting case progress, minimizing burden and expense, and removing contentiousness as much as practicable. [citations omitted]. If counsel fail in this responsibility—willfully or not—these principles of an open discovery process are undermined, coextensively inhibiting the courts’ ability to objectively resolve their clients’ disputes and the credibility of its resolution.”).

# **The Sedona Conference Cooperation Proclamation**

This “Cooperation Proclamation” calls for a paradigm shift for the discovery process; success will not be instant. The Sedona Conference views this as a three-part process to be undertaken by The Sedona Conference Working Group on Electronic Document Retention and Production (WG1):

Part I: Awareness - Promoting awareness of the need and advantages of cooperation, coupled with a call to action. This process has been initiated by The Sedona Conference Cooperation Proclamation.

Part II: Commitment - Developing a detailed understanding and full articulation of the issues and changes needed to obtain cooperative fact-finding. This will take the form of a “Case for Cooperation” which will reflect viewpoints of all legal system stakeholders. It will incorporate disciplines outside the law, aiming to understand the separate and sometimes conflicting interests and motivations of judges, mediators and arbitrators, plaintiff and defense counsel, individual and corporate clients, technical consultants and litigation support providers, and the public at large.

Part III: Tools - Developing and distributing practical “toolkits” to train and support lawyers, judges, other professionals, and students in techniques of discovery cooperation, collaboration, and transparency. Components will include training programs tailored to each stakeholder; a clearinghouse of practical resources, including form agreements, case management orders, discovery protocols, etc.; court-annexed e-discovery ADR with qualified counselors and mediators, available to assist parties of limited means; guides for judges faced with motions for sanctions; law school programs to train students in the technical, legal, and cooperative aspects of e-discovery; and programs to assist individuals and businesses with basic e-record management, in an effort to avoid discovery problems altogether.

## **Conclusion**

It is time to build upon modern Rules amendments, state and federal, which address e-discovery. Using this springboard, the legal profession can engage in a comprehensive effort to promote pre-trial discovery cooperation. Our “officer of the court” duties demand no less. This project is not utopian; rather, it is a tailored effort to effectuate the mandate of court rules calling for a “just, speedy, and inexpensive determination of every action” and the fundamental ethical principles governing our profession.

# ***Judicial Endorsements***

---

## **Alabama**

Hon. John L. Carroll (retired)  
Birmingham

Hon. William E. Cassady  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of Alabama  
Mobile

## **Arizona**

Hon. David G. Campbell  
U.S. District Court, District of Arizona  
Phoenix

Hon. Andrew D. Hurwitz  
U.S. Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit  
Phoenix

## **Arkansas**

Hon. Barry A. Bryant  
U.S. District Court, Western District of Arkansas  
Texarkana

Hon. Jerry W. Cavaneau  
U.S. District Court, Eastern District of Arkansas  
Little Rock

## **California**

Hon. Gail A. Andler  
Superior Court of California, County of Orange  
Santa Ana

Hon. Maria A. Audero  
U.S. District Court, Central District of California  
Los Angeles

Hon. Robert N. Block  
U.S. District Court, Central District of California  
Santa Ana

Hon. William V. Gallo  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of California  
San Diego

Hon. Jay C. Gandhi  
U.S. District Court, Central District of California  
Los Angeles

Hon. Susan Y. Illston  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of California  
San Francisco

Hon. Elizabeth D. Laporte  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of California  
San Francisco

Hon. Arthur Nakazato  
U.S. District Court, Central District of California  
Santa Ana

Hon. Louisa S. Porter (retired)  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of California  
San Diego

Hon. Manuel L. Real  
U.S. District Court, Central District of California  
Los Angeles

Hon. Suzanna Segal  
U.S. District Court, Central District of California  
Los Angeles

Hon. Jon S. Tigar  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of California  
San Francisco

Hon. David C. Velasquez (retired)  
Superior Court of California, County of Orange  
Santa Ana

Hon. Carl J. West (retired)  
Superior Court of California, County of Los Angeles  
Los Angeles

## **Colorado**

Hon. Morris B. Hoffman  
Colorado 2nd Judicial District Court  
Denver

## ***Judicial Endorsements***

---

Hon. Craig B. Shaffer  
U.S. District Court, District of Colorado  
Denver

### **District of Columbia**

Hon. Francis M. Allegra  
U.S. Court of Federal Claims  
Washington, D.C.

Hon. Herbert B. Dixon, Jr.  
Superior Court of the District of Columbia  
Washington, D.C.

Hon. John M. Facciola  
U.S. District Court, District of Columbia  
Washington, D.C.

Hon. Alan Kay  
U.S. District Court, District of Columbia  
Washington, D.C.

Hon. Royce C. Lamberth  
U.S. District Court, District of Columbia  
Washington, D.C.

Hon. Gregory E. Mize (retired)  
Washington, D.C.

Hon. Kathleen McDonald O'Malley  
U.S. Court of Appeals for the Federal Circuit  
Washington, D.C.

### **Florida**

Hon. Ralph Artigliere (retired)  
Bartow

Hon. Roy B. Dalton  
U.S. District Court, Middle District of Florida  
Orlando

Hon. Barry L. Garber  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of Florida  
Miami

Hon. Jonathan Goodman  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of Florida  
Miami

Hon. William W. Haury, Jr.  
17th Judicial Circuit Court of Florida  
Ft. Lauderdale

Hon. Gary Jones  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Florida  
Gainesville

Hon. William Matthewman  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of Florida  
West Palm Beach

Hon. Thomas E. Morris  
U.S. District Court, Middle District of Florida  
Jacksonville

Hon. Richard A. Nielsen  
13th Judicial Circuit  
Tampa

Hon. Robin S. Rosenbaum  
U.S. Court of Appeals for the Eleventh Circuit  
Fort Lauderdale

Hon. Kenneth L. Ryskamp  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of Florida  
West Palm Beach

Hon. Thomas B. Smith  
U.S. District Court, Middle District of Florida  
Orlando

Hon. Richard Tombrink, Jr.  
Fifth Judicial Circuit  
Brooksville

Hon. Ursula Ungaro  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of Florida  
Miami



## ***Judicial Endorsements***

---

### **Georgia**

Hon. Joseph C. Iannazzone  
State Court of Gwinnett County  
Lawrenceville

### **Illinois**

Hon. David G. Bernthal  
U.S. District Court, Central District of Illinois  
Urbana

Hon. Geraldine Soat Brown  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Illinois  
Chicago

Hon. Jeffrey Cole  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Illinois  
Chicago

Hon. Susan E. Cox  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Illinois  
Chicago

Hon. Morton Denlow (retired)  
Chicago

Hon. Carol A. Doyle  
U.S. Bankruptcy Court, Northern District of Illinois  
Chicago

Hon. Thomas M. Durkin  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Illinois  
Chicago

Hon. Shiela Finnegan  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Illinois  
Chicago

Hon. Peter A. Flynn  
Circuit Court of Cook County  
Chicago

Hon. Philip M. Frazier  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of Illinois  
Benton

Hon. Jeffrey T. Gilbert  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Illinois  
Chicago

Hon. Allen S. Goldberg (retired)  
Chicago

Hon. John A. Gorman (retired)  
Peoria

Hon. Jonathan Hawley  
U.S. District Court, Central District of Illinois  
Peoria

Hon. David R. Herndon  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of Illinois  
East St. Louis

Hon. James F. Holderman  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Illinois  
Chicago

Hon. Arlander Keys  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Illinois  
Chicago

Hon. Charles P. Kocoras  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Illinois  
Chicago

Hon. P. Michael Mahoney  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Illinois  
Rockford

Hon. Daniel G. Martin  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Illinois  
Chicago

Hon. Michael T. Mason  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Illinois  
Chicago

Hon. Richard Mills  
U.S. District Court, Central District of Illinois  
Springfield

# ***Judicial Endorsements***

---

Hon. Nan R. Nolan (retired)  
Chicago

Hon. Sidney I. Schenkier  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Illinois  
Chicago

Hon. Milton I. Shadur  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Illinois  
Chicago

Hon. Susan P. Sonderby  
U.S. Bankruptcy Court, Northern District of Illinois  
Chicago

Hon. Maria Valdez  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Illinois  
Chicago

Hon. Donald G. Wilkerson  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of Illinois  
East St. Louis

## **Indiana**

Hon. Kenneth H. Johnson  
Marion County Superior Court  
Indianapolis

## **Iowa**

Hon. Celeste F. Bremer  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of Iowa  
Des Moines

## **Kansas**

Hon. Gerald J. Elliott  
Johnson County District Court  
Olathe

Hon. J. Thomas Marten  
U.S. District Court, District of Kansas  
Wichita

Hon. James P. O'Hara  
U.S. District Court, District of Kansas  
Kansas City

Hon. Gerald L. Rushfelt  
U.S. District Court, District of Kansas  
Kansas City

Hon. K. Gary Sebelius  
U.S. District Court, District of Kansas  
Topeka

Hon. David Waxse  
U.S. District Court, District of Kansas  
Kansas City

## **Kentucky**

Hon. William O. Bertelsman  
U.S. District Court, Eastern District of Kentucky  
Covington

Hon. David Tapp  
28th Circuit  
Somerset

## **Louisiana**

Hon. Eldon E. Fallon  
U.S. District Court, Eastern District of Louisiana  
New Orleans

Hon. Sally Shushan  
U.S. District Court, Eastern District of Louisiana  
New Orleans

## **Maryland**

Hon. Lynne A. Battaglia  
Maryland Court of Appeals  
Annapolis

Hon. Stuart R. Berger  
Maryland Court of Special Appeals  
Baltimore

# ***Judicial Endorsements***

---

Hon. Paul W. Grimm  
U.S. District Court, District of Maryland  
Baltimore

Hon. Michael D. Mason  
Montgomery County Circuit Court  
Rockville

Hon. Albert J. Matricciani, Jr.  
Maryland Court of Special Appeals  
Baltimore

Hon. Steven I. Platt (retired)  
Upper Marlboro

## **Massachusetts**

Hon. Robert B. Collings  
U.S. District Court, District of Massachusetts  
Boston

Hon. Allan van Gestel (retired)  
Boston

Hon. Timothy S. Hillman  
U.S. District Court, District of Massachusetts  
Worcester

## **Michigan**

Hon. Virginia M. Morgan (retired)  
Ann Arbor

## **Mississippi**

Hon. Jerry A. Davis (retired)  
Aberdeen

## **Nevada**

Hon. Elizabeth Gonzalez  
Eighth Judicial District Court  
Las Vegas

## **New Jersey**

Hon. Katharine S. Hayden  
U.S. District Court, District of New Jersey  
Newark

Hon. Faith Hochberg  
U.S. District Court, District of New Jersey  
Newark

Hon. John J. Hughes (retired)  
Trenton

Hon. Esther Salas  
U.S. District Court, District of New Jersey  
Newark

## **New York**

Hon. Leonard B. Austin  
New York Supreme Court, Appellate Division  
Mineola

Hon. Naomi Reice Buchwald  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of New York  
New York

Hon. Carolyn E. Demarest  
New York Supreme Court, Commercial Division  
Brooklyn

Hon. Jonathan W. Feldman  
U.S. District Court, Western District of New York  
Rochester

Hon. Helen E. Freedman  
New York State Court, Appellate Division  
New York

Hon. John Gleeson  
U.S. District Court, Eastern District of New York  
Brooklyn

Hon. Marilyn D. Go  
U.S. District Court, Eastern District of New York  
Brooklyn

## ***Judicial Endorsements***

---

Hon. Steven M. Gold  
U.S. District Court, Eastern District of New York  
New York

Hon. Richard B. Lowe III  
New York Supreme Court, New York County  
New York

Hon. Frank Maas  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of New York  
New York

Hon. Jon Newman  
U.S. Court of Appeals, Second Circuit  
New York

Hon. Andrew J. Peck  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of New York  
New York

Hon. David E. Peebles  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of New York  
Syracuse

Hon. Shira A. Scheindlin  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of New York  
New York

Hon. Lisa Margaret Smith  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of New York  
White Plains

Hon. Richard J. Sullivan  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of New York  
New York

Hon. Ira B. Warshawsky (retired)  
Mineola

Hon. Richard C. Wesley  
U.S. Court of Appeals, Second Circuit  
New York

### **North Carolina**

Hon. Albert Diaz  
U.S. Court of Appeals for the Fourth Circuit  
Charlotte

Hon. John R. Jolly, Jr.  
North Carolina Business Court  
Raleigh

Dean David F. Levi  
Duke Law School  
Durham

Hon. Ben F. Tennille (retired)  
Greensboro

### **Ohio**

Hon. William H. Baughman, Jr.  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Ohio  
Cleveland

Hon. Sandra S. Beckwith  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of Ohio  
Cincinnati

Hon. John P. Bessey (retired)  
Columbus

Hon. Elizabeth A. Preston Deavers  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of Ohio  
Columbus

Hon. Richard A. Frye  
Franklin County Court of Common Pleas  
Columbus

Hon. Thomas H. Gerken (retired)  
Logan

Hon. David A. Katz  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Ohio  
Toledo

## ***Judicial Endorsements***

---

Hon. Karen L. Litkovitz  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of Ohio  
Cincinnati

Hon. George J. Limbert  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Ohio  
Youngstown

Hon. Michael R. Merz  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of Ohio  
Dayton

### **Oklahoma**

Hon. Robert E. Bacharach  
U.S. Court of Appeals for the Tenth Circuit  
Oklahoma City

Hon. Robin J. Cauthron  
U.S. District Court, Western District of Oklahoma  
Oklahoma City

Hon. Stephen P. Friot  
U.S. District Court, Western District of Oklahoma  
Oklahoma City

### **Oregon**

Hon. John V. Acosta  
U.S. District Court, District of Oregon  
Portland

Hon. Dennis J. Hubel  
U.S. District Court, District of Oregon  
Portland

Hon. Henry Kantor  
Multnomah County Circuit Court  
Portland

### **Pennsylvania**

Hon. Donetta W. Ambrose  
U.S. District Court, Western District of Pennsylvania  
Pittsburgh

Hon. Linda K. Caracappa  
U.S. District Court, Eastern District of Pennsylvania  
Philadelphia

Hon. Joy Flowers Conti  
U.S. District Court, Western District of Pennsylvania  
Pittsburgh

Hon. Jane Cutler Greenspan (retired)  
Philadelphia

Hon. Lisa P. Lenihan  
U.S. District Court, Western District of Pennsylvania  
Pittsburgh

Hon. Anthony Scirica  
U.S. Court of Appeals, Third Circuit  
Philadelphia

Hon. Christine A. Ward  
Allegheny Court of Common Pleas  
Pittsburgh

### **South Carolina**

Hon. Clifton Newman  
South Carolina Circuit Court  
Kingstree

### **Tennessee**

Hon. Joe B. Brown  
U.S. District Court, Middle District of Tennessee  
Nashville

Hon. Diane K. Vescovo  
U.S. District Court, Western District of Tennessee  
Memphis

### **Texas**

Hon. Andrew W. Austin  
U.S. District Court, Western District of Texas  
Austin

## ***Judicial Endorsements***

---

Hon. Letitia Clark  
U.S. Bankruptcy Court, Southern District of Texas  
Houston

Hon. Leonard Davis  
U.S. District Court, Eastern District of Texas  
Tyler

Hon. Sidney Fitzwater  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Texas  
Dallas

Hon. David C. Godbey  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Texas  
Dallas

Hon. Martin Hoffman  
68th Civil District Court  
Dallas

Hon. Martin L. Lowy  
101st Civil District Court  
Dallas

Hon. Maryrose Milloy  
U.S. District Court, Southern District of Texas  
Houston

Hon. Nancy S. Nowak (retired)  
San Antonio

Hon. Robert K. Roach  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Texas  
Wichita Falls

Hon. Xavier Rodriguez  
U.S. District Court, Western District of Texas  
San Antonio

Hon. Renée Harris Toliver  
U.S. District Court, Northern District of Texas  
Dallas

### **Washington**

Hon. James P. Donohue  
U.S. District Court, Western District of Washington  
Seattle

Hon. Ricardo Martinez  
U.S. District Court, Western District of Washington  
Seattle

Hon. Barbara Jacobs Rothstein  
U.S. District Court, Western District of Washington  
Seattle

Hon. Karen L. Strombom  
U.S. District Court, Western District of Washington  
Seattle

### **Wisconsin**

Hon. Shirley Abrahamson  
Wisconsin Supreme Court  
Madison

Hon. Aaron E. Goodstein  
U.S. District Court, Eastern District of Wisconsin  
Milwaukee

Hon. Richard J. Sankovitz  
Milwaukee County Circuit Court  
Milwaukee